

Otago Lane Consultation 2

Summary of Consultation Issues

Item	Issue	GOW	Development Team Response
1	The corner block on Otago Street allows for an additional three storeys with an extra two on the remainder of the block. How does this fit in within the conservation area?	GOW, FOGW, HCC	The increase in height marks the end of the block and pronounces the lane as a space. Following consultation, the corner block has been reduced to the same height as the rest of the block, the top floor of which is now a pitched slated roof on the west elevation. Cladding this block in sandstone and increasing the window sizes significantly increases the sympathy of the fit with the conservation area.
2	With regard to the overall height and the rooflines, why is the Unite Building being used as a point of reference when it is already too high?	HCC, GOW	We have looked at the overall heights within the proposals in the existing urban block context, namely the block created by Gibson Street, Park Road, Great Western Road and Otago Street, which contains a variety of heights and varied rooflines and believe them to be in keeping. We have also given consideration to the heights of the proposals granted consent in 1988. Following consultation, however, Block D (along with Blocks C and E) has been reduced in height and is now below the level of the Unite Building.
3	the overall height of Blocks C and D is too big	FOGW	The heights of both Blocks C and D have been reduced by at least one floor from the original proposals. In doing this the buildings now sit below the level of not only the Unite building but also the general height of the urban block.
4	The overall scale and density of development remain too great.	GOW, WPCC, HCC, OLCA	The density of the development is in line with that recorded in City Plan 2 for inner urban development. The scale of the building is reflective of the historic built form on the site and also that of the extant 1988 consent proposals.
5	The proposed buildings completely encircle the existing mews buildings and they will suffer from overshadowing	OLCA, HCC	The proposals were designed to bring a frontage to the civic space intended for Otago Lane and to “re-skin” the rear elevation of the Unite building. The design is compliant with the technical obligations and it is also relevant that the new development sits to the north of these properties thereby diminishing the effect of overshadowing. Daylight issues have been considered and the 18 metre rule governing privacy is a guideline / ‘rule of thumb’ which generally provides acceptable levels of daylight. It is also worth noting that the site, with the exception of the last 20 years, has always been built on and the development consented to in 1988 allowed for buildings of a similar scale.

6	The development is not in keeping with the surrounding area as the roads in the immediate vicinity are wider than Otago Lane	OLCA	The majority of the development covers the remodelling and enhancement of the existing building to Otago St. The remainder of the development is no larger than the previous building footprint and massing that covered the site for over one hundred years. That said the proposals not only widen the lane at the junction with Otago St, but also increase the public realm from the existing situation. As the proposals look to reduce the vehicular traffic, this should be seen as a positive impact on the lane.
7	The height of Block B on Otago Lane is too great	GOW	The scale of Block B is similar to that of the historic built form that stood on the site for over one hundred years. It is also lower than the extant proposals from the 1988 Beechwood Homes planning approval, which were at 5 stories high facing the lane.
8	Bearing in mind this is in a conservation area, did the proposals preserve or enhance the character of this area?	FOGW	This was a principal dilemma of the design as was the poor quality of the existing block on Otago Street. An emphasis has therefore been placed on enhancing this block in terms of the materials – natural stone, the building lines – introduction of bay windows, and the window design – creating a vertical emphasis to the windows. Along with this the proposals look to the historic form of the site and use this as a marker for setting out the building elements off the lane. The 2 drum building fronting the river will provide a positive end stop to the unite building and offer visual interest when viewed from Great Western Road. The proposed finish of natural stone being appropriate for the conservation area. The proposals for the lane will provide an area of public realm open space for local residents and businesses. With the north side of the lane relined with buildings as it would have historically had; as opposed to the poor quality car park and self seeded planting.
9	Will the developer undertake a Conservation Area Appraisal?	FOGW	A conservation area appraisal of the site is being prepared and will form part of the application.
10	Have you been led to believe by the planning department that consent will be granted on the proposals as they are?	WPCC	The ongoing discussions with the Planning Department were to allow the project team to develop proposals that accommodated, where possible, the matters arising from these meetings; the intention being to lodge an application that the development team are comfortable with in terms of the City Plan and general National Planning Policy and Guidance. That said the planning department would not formally commit to a position prior to a planning application being lodged; all their correspondence pre application being 'without prejudice'
11	Is it legal to exclude parking from the scheme?	PMcN	A survey of the existing parking was undertaken which demonstrated that it was very much under-used. The car free obligations would require to be included in the Deeds to the property and would form part of the marketing campaign to ensure there was no doubt in anybody's mind as to the parking situation. We understand the provisions are in line with both planning regulations and the law.
12	Can the 1988 consent not only be extant for 5 years?	HCC, FOGW	As outlined in the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997, a consent has an indefinite life if works are commenced on site. This is what took place, as is noted in the Planning Committee Pre-Report for the 1997 Consent to Beazer Homes.

13	What attention has been paid to the presumption against development of open space as per SPP 11 (now known as Scottish Planning Policy, as of February 2010) ?	OLCA	The City Plan allows for development of open space if it is being enhanced. The presumption against development of open space has been carefully considered in the Landscape Architects report. In this it is demonstrated that the existing situation is of relatively poor quality (this backed up in the technical reports from the Tree Survey and the Ecologist), with the proposals demonstrating how these offer an enhancement from the existing situation. Our approach here has been agreed with the council landscape and ecology teams as providing a better landscape setting and importantly enhancing the wildlife corridor.
14	Why do the proposals not fall within the scope of RES 6?	OLCA, FOGW, WPCC, HCC, PMcN,	In considering the scope of RES 6 it is important to understand the historic position and make-up of the lane. In the case of Otago Lane it has a long history of housing 'large' scale buildings in the form of Hubbard's Bakery and a garage; these buildings being around 4 stories or thereby. Importantly these buildings were demolished to make way for the 1988 Beechwood Homes consent, which would have 'replaced' them with another 5 storey building in the lane. The 1988 consent was considered under the West End Local Plan, which offered similar protection to 'back lanes' as the current City Plan 2; it is therefore reasonable to consider that the planning position here would be consistent in supporting a further application for building in the lane of similar height. Accordingly it is not that RES 6 does or indeed does not apply to the site, but more of a consideration of the historic context of the site, i.e. the site has always had large buildings on it, therefore these are appropriate for this location.
15	Will existing businesses and occupiers need to be re-located during works?	HCC	Any development in a city environment will bring some disruption and agreements would need to be reached with all those affected as to how the impact on their premises/movements could be minimised. We would anticipate further conversations with the businesses and residents regarding these matters in the event that consent is granted.
16	Will existing parking for residents and businesses remain?	OLCA, HCC	The design intention is to create a pedestrian priority area of public realm to the lane; accordingly the removal of parked vehicles from this is important in achieving this goal, save for the requirement for deliveries and servicing, which would see incidental traffic. Existing residents would be eligible to apply for a parking permit.
17	Does the developer envisage taking over and redeveloping the buildings on the south side of the Lane? If not, will any assurances be given about that? Will any contribution be made to the costs of restoring and preserving them?	GOW	There are no proposals to redevelop the existing properties on Otago Lane, in which the developer has no legal interest. The developer has had dialogue with existing tenants and owners. The developer would have no intention of promoting the development of the existing properties against the wishes of the owners/tenants and is happy to give assurances about this. There has been no discussion at this stage of the developer making a contribution towards the upkeep of the existing properties.

18	What about Tchai-Ovna's garden?	GOW, OLCA	The land that Tchai-Ovna use as garden space is not owned by them but by the developer. There is currently no legal right of occupation by Tchai Ovna. If the development does go ahead, it would be hoped that Tchai-Ovna could utilise the external courtyard space for outside seating.
19	What attention has been paid to access issues, especially for emergency and land services?	OLCA	The lane would be 2m wider, albeit with a shared surface, and the cobbles would remain. The aim is to have on-site recycling which should reduce the number of visits required to uplift that would have been necessary with wheelie bins. There would be no issue for emergency access vehicles as the Lane would be wider and the turning head larger than at present.
20	During the time of Hubbards Bakery, the whole site was covered with a building that was only 2 storeys high	WPCC	Photographic evidence suggests that the site had buildings equivalent in height to between 2 and 4 storeys over the majority of the site.
21	Refuse collection is a big issue in the area and we wanted to know what the proposals are.	WPCC	The proposals are for onsite recycling and that the 24 hour concierge would be responsible for ensuring this was well managed
22	Will there be a significant increase in vehicular traffic for removals, deliveries etc. even if the scheme is car free and will the Lane be able to cope?	FORK, OLCA, FOGW	Whilst there would likely be an increase in traffic for deliveries etc., there would be an overall reduction in the number of cars accessing the lane due to the car-free requirement. For a car free scheme, approximately 10% of parking is required to be provided for the use of visitors, car hire etc. The scheme also has to be managed 24 hours a day and it is the developer's proposals that a concierge/site manager would be in place on this basis. The duties of the concierge would also be to oversee the onsite recycling and the general upkeep and security of the immediate area. The Lane will also be approximately 2 metres wider than at present, with an integrated pavement & road and also retaining the cobbled character.
23	How might the lane be enhanced through development?	FOGW	<p>There are a number of key factors that will see an enhancement to the lane:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Removal of car parking, railings and low quality self seeded planting, this being replaced by new planting and buildings finished in high quality materials. - The lane will be resurfaced in setts, with the existing setts re-laid and made up with either new/reclaimed to match the existing. - The width of the lane will increase as it moves west to east towards the river, thereby opening up the connection both physical and visual to the river. - The promotion of a car free development will reduce the vehicular traffic to the lane and make it more pedestrian friendly. <p>The commercial units proposed for the lane are seen as complementary to the existing businesses, and will provide local services.</p>
24	What provision is there for replacing the bin shelters that currently serve the mews?	OLCA	There would not be bin areas on the refurbished Lane but there would be opportunity to incorporate the waste disposal requirements of the existing residents within the centralised recycling facilities of the development. The developer would seek to reach agreement with the existing business users as to how to

			best to meet their waste disposal requirements along with those of the new businesses.
25	How long and how disruptive do the developers see the process of building being?	OLCA	The development would be phased over eighteen months. With regard to access arrangements, this would need to be figured out with all the neighbours affected by the works further down the line. While it was acknowledged that some residents have had previous experience of poor constructor relations, the aim would very much be to work with all the neighbours to ensure that disruption to businesses and residents is minimised.
26	There has been little or no consideration of the "human element".	OLCA	The aim has very much been to create a sense of 'place', for living, working and recreation. The aspiration is that the refurbished Lane would provide a public realm environment for the beneficial use of both existing and new residents, current and future visitors.
27	Residents of the mews would be looking into the back of a large building where at present they have an open aspect to the river.	OLCA	The proposed building form is reflective of the historic building position, which would have 'blocked' views to the river from the Mews.
28	The Proposals will affect a wider Glasgow community who frequent the Lane and will add to 'sameness' of West End	OLCA	It is very much hoped that the existing businesses will remain and that they, and their customers, can benefit from the enhanced public space, the increased connection with the river and the additional retail presence. The aim is to retain and enhance the individual charm of the Lane.
29	How many new inhabitants of Otago Lane will there be?	OLCA	it is likely to be in the region 120-160, with around 100 more people coming through Otago Lane
30	There has never been a building where Block B is due to be sited.	OLCA	The historic building form on the site covered the full red line development site, which includes Block B (D)
31	Do they expect to sell/rent to students, young professionals or others?	GOW	The developer anticipates selling/renting to a range of individuals. At this stage he cannot predict who will buy or rent property. However, accommodation will not specifically be targeted at students. He hopes that by listening to the original concern about the studio flats and promoting a more mixed scheme will mean that a more mixed community will be created here. He thinks that the creation of a car club, the provision of the concierge service and the provision of a "residents room" for meetings etc will all support community cohesion.
32	The mix of types of flat is better for community sustainability	GOW	The concerns over an exclusively studio-based development raised during the first consultation were taken on board and a greater range of accommodation is now proposed.

33	Do they expect a fairly stable population or one that constantly changes?	GOW	It is difficult to predict the answer to this. However, it is hoped that the inclusion of two and three bedroom flats, as well as the improved amenities on offer, would lead to a less transient population.
34	What tenure will the flats have and will they be at affordable prices?	GOW	Flats will have mixed tenure. The intention is provide the studio flat at affordable prices, providing an accessible entry point into the West End Property Market.
35	Will the windows be like those in the adjoining ne block (Unite) small and rather high so you cannot sit in a chair and admire the view?	GOW	The window detail is a significant feature of this development, the concept being large bay style windows and also improving the windows of the existing properties on Otago Street, including the addition of bay windows.
36	Will the public have access to the river and the pathways around the flats or will it be a gated development open only to residents? If so where will the gates be?	GOW	No, it's not proposed to have public access to the river. This has been a strong recommendation of both the Urban Design Panel and the Police. There are two landscaped zones on the river edge. The first would be in between buildings C & D and it is not intended that public access would be allowed. However, it is proposed that the increased landscaped lane/courtyard area would provide the opportunity for casual sitting/recreation. The landscaped area behind buildings A, B & C would be private to the occupiers of these properties. Public access will be permitted to the lane and hard landscaped areas/certain pathways but not to all pathways e.g. on the river edge. Restricting access to the river edge also helps protect the enhanced wildlife corridor. The gates to the (limited car park for the) development would be at the pend entrance under block B.
37	What will the construction materials be for the shell of the flats?	GOW	It will probably be concrete and we are currently investigating opportunities to use 50% recycled materials within the concrete. The reasoning behind this would be sound proofing and warmth
38	What kind of uses is anticipated within the commercial space in the lane	GOW	The idea behind the commercial space is not to create an Ashton Lane/Public House environment but to provide commercial facilities that would support both the new and existing communities. This could be coffee shop/laundrette/office type uses or could be independent retailers such as are there at present. The developer has no intention of promoting the lane for social/licensed/restaurant uses and no use of this type will form part of the application. His view is that the community is well served by this type of use on Gibson Street.
39	Why flat roofs rather than pitched?	FORK, HCC	It is now proposed that Block A on Otago Street will have a pitched, slated roof. The remaining roofs will be flat roofs for the purposes of surface water attenuation, as part of a sustainable urban drainage system and the roofs would also benefit from meadow planting, increasing the biodiversity.

40	What type of social housing is anticipated?	FORK	Discussions had been held with a provider for social housing for the elderly who would be interested in occupying block D, facing onto the river. This would comprise a mixture of 1 & 2 bedroom apartments and would not only be designed to be suitable for disabled access but would also have design requirements aimed at elderly users. NOTE: Subsequent to the consultation meetings, the social housing element was removed from the proposal due to financial constraints on the prospective housing association.
41	The marked changes to the original scheme are impressive and several key concerns have been addressed, such as the buildings becoming less angular and stepping back from the river, allowing better protection to the waterfront.	FORK	Noted
42	What will happen at the river edge of block D and will the undercroft be incorporated?	FOGW	There will be no public access to the river's edge and the only access to this area will be for maintenance. This will severely restrict the current access route of graffiti artists to the Unite undercroft, which is generally acknowledged as an eyesore. An aspiration of the design team would be to continue the landscaping provision along to the south to incorporate this undercroft.
43	How will the development respond to the wider urban / civic context?	FOGW	The development urban position looks to address the historic context of the site, as an edge to the west end that is marked by a wide variety of building typologies reflective of the industrial past of the area, i.e. railway goods yard and station. This making it quite different from the other areas in the west end which have a much more residential led aesthetic.
44	Will any of the flats be single aspect?	FOGW	Approximately 20.
45	How many additional units will there be?	WPCC	There will be 142 units in total. There are currently 48 units on the Otago Street section thereby creating an additional 94 units.
46	Will a shell company undertake the development?	PMcN	The development is being promoted by a company specific to this project.

47	Is there disruption to the existing green corridor?	OLCA, FOGW	The current proposals would enhance the existing habitat to wildlife, replacing self seeded planting with indigenous species and also upgrading the existing brick retaining wall, which fronts the river, to be friendlier to wildlife. Restricting access to the river edge will also help the wildlife corridor to flourish, as well as restricting the opportunities for graffiti and fly-tipping.
48	Has any consideration been given to using on site ways to generate electricity or even a low level hydro scheme?	FORK	All options continue to be investigated, however, it is understood that several of these schemes do require a minimum scale of development to be justifiable.
49	Is the development site on the flood plain of the Kelvin?	FOGW	There are on-going investigations which will form a drainage and flood report, however, it is understood that the river, were it to flood, would flood on to the east bank of the Kelvin in this area and not on to the development site. As such the site would not appear to have a requirement for anti-flood devices.
50	Could you please outline in more detail the sustainable elements of the proposals?	HCC	The proposals are to have combined heat and power system, an onsite recycling facility, green roofs to help bio-diversity and to be car free. In addition, the aim is to maximise the amount of recycled materials in the concrete frames and to try and exceed the minimum building regulation standards in terms of energy, efficiency and insulation. It is hoped that the development will be an exemplar of sustainable development in the city.
51	Can you provide equivalent examples of gabion-secured landscaping?	GOW	Examples will be included within the landscaping and design element of the application.
52	Will there be any restrictions on the use of cars by residents?	GOW	It is proposed that this is a car-free scheme. There will be no permanent parking provided for residents and they will not be able to apply for residents parking permits. There will be 15 spaces within the development boundaries, however, for the use of car rental, car club schemes, visitors and deliveries. The scheme will be marketed as car-free and these provisions will also be in the deeds/leases. The developer believes there is a market for a car-free and sustainable development in this location.
53	Will people visiting or working in the shops and commercial premises at street level be permitted to bring cars into the lane and park them there?	GOW	As per the answer to 16, the Lane is being re-designed to create an attractive pedestrianised space and, as such, parking will not be permitted other than for loading and unloading.

54	What impact will the car free designation have on the parking in the vicinity, which is already under severe pressure?	GOW, OLCA, HCC	The scheme will be marketed as car-free and owners of the flats will not be eligible for residents' permits, so there will be no additional pressure on these spaces. The developer does not anticipate that purchasers will still wish to own and operate their own car, particularly with a car club operational on site, however it is acknowledged that they cannot be prevented from doing so. If there are some that do so, they would likely park their car out with the local restrictions, as others currently do.
55	If 3 bed flats are aimed at families, surely they would need a parking space?	GOW	Of the 15 or so spaces retained in the development a small number of these will be 'reserved' for the larger family flats, as we recognise that they are likely to have private cars.
56	What arrangements do they envisage for control and cleaning of public areas and will they be paid for by residents? (River frontage could become a magnet for drinkers and drug users.)	GOW	All service charges in relation to maintenance of common areas (which are not adopted) would be paid for by residents. The current proposals would also include a concierge/janitorial service on site. The developer is aware of concerns about drinking/drug abuse which is why he has taken police advice and restricted access to the river edge.
57	There was concern expressed about ground conditions and an enquiry whether the architect knew that after the existing flats in Otago Street were built, cracks had appeared and remedial work was required	GOW	All remedial works required in relation to ground conditions would be carried out. Although we were unaware that the buildings on Otago Street had previously required remedial work this can happen after a building is complete due to settlement of concrete etc.
58	How long will the proposed buildings in Otago street last, as the existing ones are only there 10 years and it seems a waste?	GOW	The developer intends to use high quality material such as sandstone and create a quality product which would have longevity. The reason behind re-cladding and demolishing part of the existing property on Otago Street is to improve the quality and appearance of the existing properties on Otago Street which have few admirers.

	HCC	HILLHEAD COMMUNITY COUNCIL
	FORK	FRIENDS OF THE RIVER KELVIN
	GOW	GOW TRIANGLE COMMUNITY
	WPCC	WOODLANDS AND PARK COMMUNITY COUNCIL
	FOGW	FRIENDS OF GLASGOW WEST
	PMcN	PAULINE McNEIL MSP